

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:18-cv-01315-VEC**

Bonner v. Central Intelligence Agency
Assigned to: Judge Valerie E. Caproni
Related Case: 1:17-cv-09378-VEC
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 02/14/2018
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of Information Act
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff**Raymond Bonner**

represented by **Hannah Bloch-Wehba**
Media Freedom & Information Access Clinic
P.O. Box 208215
New Haven, CT 06520-8215
(203) 436-5824
Email: hannah.bloch-wehba@yale.edu
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David A. Schulz
Ballard Spahr LLP (NYC)
1675 Broadway, 19th Floor
New York, NY 10019
(212) 850-6103
Fax: (212) 223-1942
Email: schulzd@ballardspahr.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant**Central Intelligence Agency**

represented by **Christopher Kendrick Connolly**
United States Attorney's Office
SDNY
86 Chambers Street
3 Floor
New York, NY 10007
(212) 637-2761
Fax: (212) 637-2786
Email: christopher.connolly@usdoj.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sarah Sheive Normand
U.S. Attorney's Office, SDNY (86 Chambers St.)
86 Chambers Street
New York, NY 10007
(212) 637-2200
Fax: (212) 637-2686
Email: sarah.normand@usdoj.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
02/14/2018	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Central Intelligence Agency. (Filing Fee \$ 400.00, Receipt Number 0208-14699996) Document filed by Raymond Bonner. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D)(Schulz, David) (Entered: 02/14/2018)

02/14/2018	<u>2</u>	FILING ERROR – SIGNATURE ERROR – CIVIL COVER SHEET filed. (Schulz, David) Modified on 2/15/2018 (pne). (Entered: 02/14/2018)
02/14/2018	<u>3</u>	STATEMENT OF RELATEDNESS re: that this action be filed as related to 17–cv–9378. Document filed by Raymond Bonner.(Schulz, David) (Entered: 02/14/2018)
02/14/2018	<u>4</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – SUMMONS REQUEST PDF ERROR – REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Central Intelligence Agency, re: <u>1</u> Complaint. Document filed by Raymond Bonner. (Schulz, David) Modified on 2/15/2018 (pne). (Entered: 02/14/2018)
02/15/2018		***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING PARTY MODIFICATION. Notice to attorney David A. Schulz. The party information for the following party has been modified: Central Intelligence Agency. The information for the party has been modified for the following reason: party role was entered incorrectly. (pne) (Entered: 02/15/2018)
02/15/2018		***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING CIVIL CASE OPENING STATISTICAL ERROR CORRECTION: Notice to attorney David A. Schulz. The following case opening statistical information was erroneously selected/entered: Jurisdiction code 3 (Federal Question). The following correction has been made to your case entry: the Jurisdiction code has been modified to 2 (U.S. Government Defendant). (pne) (Entered: 02/15/2018)
02/15/2018		CASE OPENING INITIAL ASSIGNMENT NOTICE: The above–entitled action is assigned to Judge Unassigned. (pne) (Entered: 02/15/2018)
02/15/2018		Case Designated ECF. (pne) (Entered: 02/15/2018)
02/15/2018		CASE REFERRED TO Judge Valerie E. Caproni as possibly related to 17–CV–9378. (pne) (Entered: 02/15/2018)
02/15/2018		***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT CIVIL COVER SHEET. Notice to attorney David A. Schulz to RE–FILE Document No. <u>2</u> Civil Cover Sheet. The filing is deficient for the following reason: the civil cover sheet was not signed. Re–file the document using the event type Civil Cover Sheet found under the event list Other Documents and attach the correct PDF. Use civil cover sheet issued by S.D.N.Y. dated June 2017. The S.D.N.Y. Civil Cover Sheet dated June 2017 is located at http://nysd.uscourts.gov/file/forms/civil–cover–sheet.. (pne) (Entered: 02/15/2018)
02/15/2018		***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS. Notice to Attorney David A. Schulz to RE–FILE Document No. <u>4</u> Request for Issuance of Summons. The filing is deficient for the following reasons: the name of the defendant must be the first party name that appears in the 'To' field on the Request for Issuance of Summons; the second party name entered in the 'To' field must include care of (C/O). Re–file the document using the event type Request for Issuance of Summons found under the event list Service of Process – select the correct filer/filers – and attach the correct summons form PDF. (pne) (Entered: 02/15/2018)
02/16/2018	<u>5</u>	CIVIL COVER SHEET filed. (Schulz, David) (Entered: 02/16/2018)
02/16/2018	<u>6</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Central Intelligence Agency, re: <u>1</u> Complaint. Document filed by Raymond Bonner. (Schulz, David) (Entered: 02/16/2018)
02/20/2018	<u>7</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to Central Intelligence Agency. (vf) (Entered: 02/20/2018)
02/27/2018	<u>8</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Complaint, Exhibits, Civil Cover Sheet, and Statement of Relatedness served on Attorney General of the United States and U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of New York on 2/20/2018. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Raymond Bonner. (Schulz, David) (Entered: 02/27/2018)
02/27/2018	<u>9</u>	SUMMONS RETURNED EXECUTED (FOIA CASE) Summons and Complaint served. Central Intelligence Agency served on 2/21/2018, answer due 3/23/2018. Service was accepted by Hanna S., Litigation, authorized to accept service. Document

		filed by Raymond Bonner. (Schulz, David) (Entered: 02/27/2018)
02/28/2018		CASE ACCEPTED AS RELATED. Create association to 1:17-cv-09378-VEC. Notice of Assignment to follow. (jc) (Entered: 02/28/2018)
02/28/2018		NOTICE OF CASE REASSIGNMENT to Judge Valerie E. Caproni. Judge Unassigned is no longer assigned to the case. (jc) (Entered: 02/28/2018)
02/28/2018		Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman is so designated. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 636(c) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 73(b)(1) parties are notified that they may consent to proceed before a United States Magistrate Judge. Parties who wish to consent may access the necessary form at the following link: http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php . (jc) (Entered: 02/28/2018)
03/08/2018	<u>10</u>	NOTICE OF INITIAL PRETRIAL CONFERENCE: Initial Conference set for 4/6/2018 at 10:00 AM in Courtroom 443 of the Thurgood Marshall U.S. Courthouse, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Valerie E. Caproni. (Signed by Judge Valerie E. Caproni on 3/8/2018) (mro) (Entered: 03/09/2018)
03/26/2018	<u>11</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Sarah Sheive Normand on behalf of Central Intelligence Agency. (Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 03/26/2018)
03/26/2018	<u>12</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 03/26/2018)
03/26/2018	<u>13</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Christopher Kendrick Connolly on behalf of Central Intelligence Agency. (Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 03/26/2018)
03/29/2018	<u>14</u>	LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference <i>and parties' joint pre-conference letter</i> addressed to Judge Valerie E. Caproni from AUSA Christopher Connolly dated March 29, 2018. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 03/29/2018)
03/29/2018	<u>15</u>	ORDER granting <u>14</u> Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference. The April 6, 2018 initial pretrial conference is adjourned to May 11, 2018 at 10:00 a.m., Courtroom 443, Thurgood Marshall U.S. Courthouse. The parties' request to forgo using the Court's standard Case Management Plan is granted. No later than May 3, 2018, the parties must submit a joint proposed production schedule. Initial Conference set for 5/11/2018 at 10:00 AM in Courtroom 443, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Valerie E. Caproni. (Signed by Judge Valerie E. Caproni on 3/29/2018) (kgo) Modified on 5/25/2018 (kgo). (Entered: 03/30/2018)
05/02/2018	<u>16</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – MOTION for Hannah Bloch–Wehba to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208–15017141. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by Raymond Bonner. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit of Hannah Bloch–Wehba in Support of Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing for D.C. Bar, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing for State Bar of Texas, # <u>4</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Bloch–Wehba, Hannah) Modified on 5/2/2018 (jc). (Entered: 05/02/2018)
05/02/2018		>>>NOTICE REGARDING DEFICIENT MOTION TO APPEAR PRO HAC VICE. Notice to RE–FILE Document No. <u>16</u> MOTION for Hannah Bloch–Wehba to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208–15017141. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff... The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): missing Certificate of Good Standing from Supreme Court of Texas (our court does not accept state bar certificates for Texas). Re–file the motion as a Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice – attach the correct signed PDF – select the correct named filer/filers – attach valid Certificates of Good Standing issued within the past 30 days – attach Attorney Affidavit – attach Proposed Order. (jc) (Entered: 05/02/2018)
05/02/2018	<u>17</u>	MOTION for Hannah Bloch–Wehba to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by Raymond Bonner. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit of Hannah Bloch–Wehba in Support of Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing for D.C. Bar, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing for Texas Supreme Court, # <u>4</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Bloch–Wehba, Hannah) (Entered: 05/02/2018)

05/02/2018		>>>NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. <u>17</u> MOTION for Hannah Bloch–Wehba to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (bcu) (Entered: 05/02/2018)
05/02/2018	<u>18</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Valerie E. Caproni from AUSA Sarah S. Normand dated 05/02/2018 re: Joint Proposed Production Schedule. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 05/02/2018)
05/04/2018	<u>19</u>	ORDER FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE granting <u>17</u> Motion for Hannah Bloch–Wehba to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Valerie E. Caproni on 5/4/2018) (kgo) (Entered: 05/04/2018)
05/04/2018	<u>20</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT: on re: <u>18</u> Letter filed by Central Intelligence Agency. ENDORSEMENT: The Court adopts the parties' proposed schedule for productions and monthly status updates. The May 11, 2018 conference is cancelled. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Valerie E. Caproni on 5/04/2018) (ama) (Entered: 05/04/2018)
06/01/2018	<u>21</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Valerie E. Caproni from AUSA Sarah S. Normand dated June 1, 2018 re: Joint Status Report. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 06/01/2018)
07/02/2018	<u>22</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 07/02/2018)
08/02/2018	<u>23</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 08/02/2018)
08/31/2018	<u>24</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 08/31/2018)
10/01/2018	<u>25</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 10/01/2018)
11/01/2018	<u>26</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 11/01/2018)
12/03/2018	<u>27</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 12/03/2018)
12/27/2018	<u>28</u>	STANDING ORDER M10–468: The United States Attorney's Office shall notify the Court immediately upon the restoration of Department of Justice funding. (As further set forth in this Order.) (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 12/27/2018) (mro) (Entered: 01/02/2019)
12/27/2018		Case Stayed (ne) (Entered: 01/17/2019)
02/01/2019	<u>29</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 02/01/2019)
03/01/2019	<u>30</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 03/01/2019)
04/01/2019	<u>31</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 04/01/2019)
05/01/2019	<u>32</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 05/01/2019)
06/03/2019	<u>33</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 06/03/2019)
07/01/2019	<u>34</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 07/01/2019)
08/01/2019	<u>35</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 08/01/2019)

09/03/2019	<u>36</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 09/03/2019)
10/01/2019	<u>37</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 10/01/2019)
10/02/2019	<u>38</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (37 in 1:18-cv-01315-VEC) Status Report filed by Central Intelligence Agency, (55 in 1:17-cv-09378-VEC) Status Report filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation, Department of Defense, Central Intelligence Agency. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. The next status update is due on November 1, 2019. (Signed by Judge Valerie E. Caproni on 10/2/2019) (mro) (Entered: 10/02/2019)
11/07/2019	<u>39</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 11/07/2019)
11/07/2019	<u>40</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT: on re: (57 in 1:17-cv-09378-VEC) Status Report filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation, Department of Defense, Central Intelligence Agency. re:(39 in 1:18-cv-01315-VEC) Status Report filed by Central Intelligence Agency. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. The next status update is due by December 2, 2019. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Valerie E. Caproni on 11/07/2019) (ama) (Entered: 11/07/2019)
12/02/2019	<u>41</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 12/02/2019)
12/03/2019	<u>42</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>41</u> STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. The next status update is due by January 6, 2020. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Valerie E. Caproni on 12/2/2019) (rjm) (Entered: 12/03/2019)
01/06/2020	<u>43</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 01/06/2020)
01/07/2020	<u>44</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (43 in 1:18-cv-01315-VEC) Status Report filed by Central Intelligence Agency, (61 in 1:17-cv-09378-VEC) Status Report filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation, Department of Defense, Central Intelligence Agency. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. The next status update is due by February 3, 2020. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Valerie E. Caproni on 1/7/2020) (rro) (Entered: 01/07/2020)
02/03/2020	<u>45</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency..(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 02/03/2020)
02/04/2020	<u>46</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>45</u> Status Report filed by Central Intelligence Agency, (63 in 1:17-cv-09378-VEC) Status Report filed by Central Intelligence Agency. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. The next status update is due by March 2, 2020. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Valerie E. Caproni on 2/4/2020) (va) (Entered: 02/12/2020)
03/02/2020	<u>47</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency..(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 03/02/2020)
03/03/2020	<u>48</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (65 in 1:17-cv-09378-VEC) Status Report filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation, Department of Defense, Central Intelligence Agency, (47 in 1:18-cv-01315-VEC) Status Report filed by Central Intelligence Agency. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. The next status update is due by April 1, 2020. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Valerie E. Caproni on 3/3/2020) (kv) (Entered: 03/03/2020)
04/01/2020	<u>49</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency..(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 04/01/2020)
04/01/2020	<u>50</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (49 in 1:18-cv-01315-VEC) Status Report filed by Central Intelligence Agency, (67 in 1:17-cv-09378-VEC) Status Report filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation, Department of Defense, Central Intelligence Agency. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. The next status update is due by May 1, 2020. So Ordered (Signed by Judge Valerie E. Caproni on 4/1/2020) (js) (Entered: 04/02/2020)

05/01/2020	<u>51</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency..(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 05/01/2020)
05/01/2020	<u>52</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT: on re: (69 in 1:17-cv-09378-VEC) Status Report filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation, Department of Defense, Central Intelligence Agency, (51 in 1:18-cv-01315-VEC) Status Report filed by Central Intelligence Agency. ENDORSEMENT: Application Granted. The next status update is due by June 1, 2020. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Valerie E. Caproni on 5/01/2020) (ama) (Entered: 05/01/2020)
06/01/2020	<u>53</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency..(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 06/01/2020)
06/01/2020	<u>54</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (53 in 1:18-cv-01315-VEC) Status Report filed by Central Intelligence Agency, (71 in 1:17-cv-09378-VEC) Status Report filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation, Department of Defense, Central Intelligence Agency. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. The next status update is due by July 1, 2020. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Valerie E. Caproni on 6/01/2020) (ama) (Entered: 06/01/2020)
07/01/2020	<u>55</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency..(Connolly, Christopher) (Entered: 07/01/2020)
07/02/2020	<u>56</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (73 in 1:17-cv-09378-VEC) Status Report filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation, Department of Defense, Central Intelligence Agency, (55 in 1:18-cv-01315-VEC) Status Report filed by Central Intelligence Agency. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. The proposed stipulation and order is due by August 3, 2020. (Signed by Judge Valerie E. Caproni on 7/2/2020) (cf) (Entered: 07/02/2020)